

Staffing and wage setting as crucial arena for social dialogue in Germany

Prof. Dr. Karin Gottschall and Dr. Ruth Abramowski, University of Bremen,
SOCIUM Research Center on Inequality and Social Policy

SOWELL Final Conference Brussels, December 7, 2022

Agenda

- 1 Institutional framework and expansion of ECEC and LTC in Germany
- 2 Core problems
- 3 Answers ECEC: Addressing the challenge of staffing and recruitment
- 4 Answers LTC: Addressing the challenge of wage setting
- 5 Lessons for social dialogue in social services in Germany

1 Institutional framework and expansion of ECEC and LTC in Germany

- Historically low level of public service provision due to **subsidiarity principle** privileging family and non-profit actors in service provision
- **Federalism** attributes governance of ECEC and LTC to federal states
- Specific labor law for **Christian providers** excluding unions (and strike)
- **Catching-up expansion of ECEC** since German re-unification by national government(s) taking on more responsibility (co-financing); since 2004 several reforms for expanding coverage and better quality
- Mandatory **LTC insurance** since 1995 providing **cash benefit or services**; parallel expansion of informal care in private homes (migrant live-ins) and formal homecare services and residential care; high presence of private providers (licensed since 1995)

2 Core problems in ECEC

- Employment: **aprox. 800,000 workers**; more than 90% female, more than 50% working less than 38 hours per week;
- Wage rises based on successful collective bargaining especially with public providers (1/3, 2/3 of providers are non-profit)

Problems

- **Coverage, staff-to-child ratio and opening hours** do not meet rising demand (nurseries) of parents and allow for catering to children with specific needs
- **Staff shortage and workload**, projection of need for up to 100,000 early childhood teachers until 2025
- **Insufficient capacity** and attractiveness of (non-university) school-based **ECEC teacher training** (4-5 years long and costly)

2 Core problems in ECEC

- Employment: in **homecare services aprox. 420,000**, in **residential care aprox. 800,000 employees**, more than 80% female, more than 60% in part-time, mixture of skilled and untrained personnel
- Substantial **wage rises** from 2013 onwards mainly ***by state intervention*** (introduction of minimum wage and specific legislation); also since 2020 standardization of training (in alignment with health care/nurse training)

Problems

- **High work load** restricting ‚good quality care‘, unpredictable working time rosters and lack of recognition/low status
- High **fluctuation and severe workforce shortage** both for skilled workers and care helpers
- **Fragmented interest representation** due to specific labor law, lack of organization by employers and employees

3 Answers ECEC: Addressing the challenge of staffing and recruitment (Case studies City of Bremen)

Case study 1: Staffing levels and staff composition

- **Tripartite dialogue** (social partners and state government) for decent work
- **Reform project for better staffing** in disadvantaged neighbourhoods

Case study 2: Reform of training

- Introduction of **practice-oriented training** instead of school-based training
- Facilitating **remuneration of school-based training and further education**

4 Answers LTC: Addressing the challenge of wage setting

Case study 3: Willingness of Christian and other non-profit providers

- Collective agreement by a **protestant elderly care provider with the service sector union** (ver.di) in federal state Hessen
- Collective agreement by **christian and non-profit providers with ver.di** in city-state Bremen

Case study 4: Willingness of private providers

- Collective agreement by a **private provider (local unit Luneburg) with union ver.di**
- Collective agreement of **private homecare providers with a small Christian union**

5 Lessons for social dialogue in social services in Germany

- **Crucial role of national government** in regulation of social services (legal claims to access social services, financing and frameworks for provision on local level)
- **Political lobbying** and dialogue with parties and governments as important **arena for social partners**
- On national and **local/state level broad coalitions** including clients, civil society organizations needed
- **Adaption of German industrial relations framework** (including co-determination on firm level) to social services needed and possible
- **Agenda** for social dialogue needs to address **not only wages, but also workload, training and career prospects**

Related publications

- Gottschall, Karin; Noack, Kristin; Rothgang, Heinz, 2022: Dependencies of Long-Term Care Policy on East-West Migration: The Case of Germany, in: Nullmeier, Frank; González de Reufels, Delia; Obinger, Herbert (Ed.), *International Impacts on Social Policy. Short Histories in Global Perspective*, Global Dynamics of Social Policy series, Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 515 - 529, [doi:10.1007/978-3-030-86645-7_40](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-86645-7_40)
- Gottschall, Karin; Abramowski, Ruth, 2022: Deutschland - ein frauenfreundlicher Wohlfahrtsstaat?, in: Nonhoff, Martin; Haunss, Sebastian; Klenk, Tanja; Pritzlaff-Scheele, Tanja (Ed.), *Gesellschaft und Politik verstehen. Frank Nullmeier zum 65. Geburtstag*, SOCIUM Schriftenreihe Ungleichheit und Sozialpolitik, Frankfurt/New York: Campus, pp. 329 - 344, [Link](#) (Date: 30.06.2022) *related publication in english:*, *The State as Employer (and Regulator) of Care Services in Germany, forthcoming in: Handbook on Gender and Employment in the Public Sector, eds. Hazel Conley and Paula Sandberg, Elsevier*
- Gottschall, Karin; Kittel, Bernhard; Briken, Kendra; Heuer, Jan-Ocko; Hils, Sylvia; Streb, Sebastian; Tepe, Markus, 2015: Public Sector Employment Regimes - Transformations of the State as an Employer, *Transformations of the State*, Houndmills/Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan
- Haasler, Simone R.; Gottschall, Karin, 2015: Still a perfect model? The gender impact of vocational training in Germany, in: *Journal of Vocational Education & Training (JVET)*, Special Issue on "Gender in vocational education and training: pathways, process and practice", 67 (1), pp. 78 - 92, [doi:10.1080/13636820.2014.922118](https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2014.922118), 09.01.2015
- Kroos, Daniela/Gottschall Karin 2012: Dualization and Gender in Social Services. The Role of the State in Germany and France. In: Emmenegger, Patrick/Häusermann, Silja/Palier, Bruno/Seeleib-Kaiser, Martin (eds), *The Age of Dualization*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 100–123.
- Schäfer, Andrea; Gottschall, Karin, 2015: From wage regulation to wage gap: how wage-setting institutions and structures shape the gender wage gap across three industries in 24 European countries and Germany, in: *Cambridge Journal of Economics*, 39 (2), pp. 467 - 496, [doi:10.1093/cje/bev005](https://doi.org/10.1093/cje/bev005), 21.02.2015